Published March 2, 2022 Updated September 13, 2022 The A-Mark Foundation www.amarkfoundation.org

#### **Table of Contents**

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
II. KEY FINDINGS	
III. BACKGROUND	
IV. COMPARATIVE ESTIMATED COSTS OF LOS ANGELES TINY HOME VILLAGES	
V. LINE ITEM CONSTRUCTION AND OPERATING COSTS FOR TINY HOME VILLAGES	
VI. CONCLUSION	19
APPENDIX Δ· PHOTOS OF LΔ'S FIRST TINY HOME VILLAGE	20

- Los Angeles has built nine tiny home villages (1,217 beds)
- Smallest Village is 74 beds, largest is 224
- Average construction cost per bed is \$42,344
- Construction costs per bed range from \$32,712 to \$65,783
- LA pays the nonprofits that run Villages \$55 per night per occupied bed
- There are additional unknown costs for City/County management and oversight

#### **I. Executive Summary**

The high level of homelessness and questions about how to deal with the issue responsibly pose a challenge to policymakers across the country. One solution has been building permanent housing units for people experiencing homelessness, but this is an expensive endeavor, with an average cost of over \$500,000 per unit recently reported in Los Angeles.

Around 2017, some cities started constructing tiny homes as temporary housing for some people experiencing homelessness. In 2021, Los Angeles ("LA") began opening tiny home villages ("Villages") for unhoused people with 64 ft² Pallet shelters, shared bathroom and laundry facilities, security, meals, and social services.

The most recent count showed 69,144 people in LA County experiencing homelessness. Given the extent of this issue and the need for new housing solutions,

we decided to write this report so that decision makers and the general public can see the cost per bed to build and operate one option for sealing with the issues, tiny home villages.

#### **II. Key Findings**

- Nine Villages with a total of 1,217 beds have opened in Los Angeles since February 2021.
- The smallest Village has 74 beds and the largest has 224 beds.
- Under COVID-19 protocol, only one bed per tiny home can currently be filled unless two people in the same household are placed together.
- The average construction cost per bed is \$42,344.
- The one-time construction costs (pre-planning, infrastructure construction, and purchase and assembly of tiny homes and related buildings such as bathrooms, staff offices, etc.) range from \$32,712 per bed to \$65,783 per bed.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Los Angeles Homeless Services Authority, "LAHSA Releases 2022 Greater Los Angeles Homeless Count Results," lahsa.org, September 8, 2022

- The nonprofit organizations that run the Villages are paid \$55 per night per occupied bed (365 days x \$55/night = \$20,075 per bed annually).<sup>2</sup>
- All of the Villages are on land owned by the city, state, or county.
- There are additional costs for City/County management and oversight, but the amounts are unclear.

Since the issues and challenges with housing the homeless population temporarily and permanently are constantly evolving, the information in this report will surely change in the years if not months ahead.

**Note:** There is tiny home village in West Los Angeles as part of the VA's Care, Treatment and Rehabilitative Services program with an estimated 110 Pallet shelters. Cost details for this Village are not included in this report because we have not found them as of publication date. A new tiny home village with 40 beds opened in Torrance in July 2022. This village will be added to this report if we are able to find the cost estimates.

#### III. Background

**A. Homelessness in Los Angeles:** The Los Angeles Homeless Services Authority's most recent estimate from June 2020 showed 66,436 people in Los Angeles County experiencing homelessness. <sup>3</sup> Skid Row (Downtown Los Angeles) has more than 2,000 people living on the streets and another 2,500 in large shelters.<sup>4</sup>

In November 2016, LA voters approved <u>Proposition HHH</u>, a \$1.2 billion bond measure intended to build 10,000 new housing units in the next decade for people experiencing homelessness.<sup>5</sup> The bond measure also called for more interim shelters and storage units. Five years after voters passed Prop HHH, homelessness had increased by 45% in LA.<sup>6</sup>

A March 2020 lawsuit brought against the City and County of Los Angeles, <u>LA Alliance for Human</u>
<u>Rights vs. City of Los Angeles and County of Los Angeles</u>, sought to force the government to provide shelter for the unhoused people in Los Angeles.<sup>7</sup> The City of Los Angeles settled the lawsuit in June 2022 with an agreement to add up to 16,000 beds or housing units at a cost of \$3 billion [an average

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Service provider Village operating budgets are still being calculated as if all beds are filled even though beds are being left empty for COVID-19 safety measures.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Los Angeles Homeless Services Authority, "2020 Greater Los Angeles Homeless Count Results," lahsa.org, June 12, 2020

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Benjamin Oreskes, Emily Alpert Reyes, and Doug Smith, "Judge orders L.A. city and county to offer shelter to everyone on skid row by fall," latimes.com, April 20, 2021

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Anna Scott and Saul Gonzalez, "\$1.2 billion and 5 years later, why has Prop HHH built only a fraction of its promised homeless housing units?," kcrw.org, November 15, 2021

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Ron Galperin, "L.A. Controller Reports Prop. HHH Homeless Housing Tops \$830K Per Unit, Urges City to Learn from Mistakes," lacontroller.org, February 23, 2022

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Nathan Solis, "Coalition Sues LA to Force Action on Homelessness Crisis," courthousenews.com, March 10, 2020

of \$187,500 per bed].<sup>8</sup> Los Angeles County reached a settlement in September 2022 with a commitment to spend \$236 million to expand services for people experiencing homelessness.<sup>9</sup>

**B. Overview of Costs for Non-Congregate (Private) Alternatives to Tiny Home Villages:** According to a <u>Prop HHH audit released by LA Controller Ron Galperin</u> on February 23, 2022, there are 8,091 permanent housing units in different stages of development, including 1,142 completed units. The audit noted that the average construction cost of a housing unit for a person experiencing homeless was \$596,846 in 2021.<sup>10</sup>

On the other side of the spectrum from permanent housing is the concept of a government-run tent campground. LA opened a "Safe Sleep Village" in April 2021 for an eight-month pilot program. <sup>11</sup> The City Council approved \$1,491,410 for the Village in a fenced-in parking lot that held 70 tents. The site had security, storage, meals, showers, and laundry for the residents. The monthly cost of \$186,426 divided by 70 tents resulted in a monthly per-tent cost of \$2,663. Multiplying by 12 shows an annual cost of \$31,959 per tent. <sup>12</sup>

While there are many additional factors needed to make a direct cost comparison between permanent housing, tent campgrounds, and tiny home villages, the above numbers offer a rough baseline to keep in mind when examining the costs of tiny homes.

**C. "Tiny Homes" and Tiny Home Villages:** Tiny homes are generally sized between 64 ft<sup>2</sup> and 100 ft<sup>2</sup>. Tiny homes are intended to serve as temporary housing to transition people from living on the street into permanent housing.

In an effort to combat homelessness in the short-term and add beds at a reasonable cost, Los Angeles has created tiny home villages ("Villages") with shared bathrooms, laundry, security, meals or kitchen facilities, and social services for the residents.

Funding for the first Village in Los Angeles ("LA") was approved by the LA City Council on September 9, 2020. <sup>13</sup> Los Angeles opened its first Village in February 2021 (at 11471 Chandler Blvd in North Hollywood), and currently has nine operating Villages.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> City News Service, "Judge Approves City's Settlement of LA Homelessness Lawsuit," spectrumnews1.com, June 14, 2022

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Associated Press, "L.A. County to Settle Lawsuit Over Homeless Crisis," ktla.com, September 12, 2022

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Ron Galperin, "The Problems and Progress of Prop. HHH," lacontroller.org, February 23, 2022

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Aaron Schrank, "LA's first city-funded homeless camp gets mixed reviews," kcrw.org, December 9, 2021

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Richard H. Llewellyn, Jr., "Fifth Report: COVID-19 Homelessness Roadmap Funding Recommendations," clkrep.lacity.org, March 18, 2021

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Tony M. Royster, "Request Authority to Negotiate and Execute a License Agreement With Hope of the Valley Rescue Mission to Operate Interim Housing at 19020-19040 West Vanowen Street," lacity.org, February 25, 2021

Most tiny homes have two beds, but a small number of wheelchair accessible single-bed shelters are included in Villages. <sup>14</sup> In Los Angeles, only one bed per tiny home is currently being filled due to COVID, unless two people in the same household are sharing a shelter. It is unclear what will happen if COVID restrictions are listed in the future and the government decides to house more than one person in a tiny home, given the debate over congregate (shared) shelters vs. non-congregate (private) shelters.<sup>15</sup>

The costs of building and operating Villages (assuming no land costs, since LA appears to use land owned by the city, county, or state) can be broken down into three categories:

- 1. One-time construction costs (pre-planning, infrastructure construction, and purchase and assembly of tiny homes and related buildings with furnishings such as bathrooms, common areas, staff offices, etc.) See details in <a href="Chart I">Chart I</a> and <a href="Chart II">Chart II</a>;
- 2. *Ongoing operational costs* (operations and management to run the Village once construction is complete) See details in Chart III; and
- 3. *City/County operations and oversight* (insurance, site power costs, staff time spent on the project, etc.)

A tiny home village was opened in West Los Angeles on the Veterans Affairs (VA) campus as part of the VA's Care, Treatment and Rehabilitative Services program in October 2021. The "Village for Vets" had a total of 110 Pallet shelters by February 2022. <sup>16</sup> Cost details for this Village are not included in this report because we have not found them as of publication date.

**D. Tiny Home Builders:** <u>Pallet Shelters</u>, based in Washington state, seems to be the main builder of the tiny homes used in Los Angeles.<sup>17</sup> Nationwide, Pallet has built 40 villages and has another 20 in development, mostly on the west coast but expanding east.

Pallet's Head of Community Partnerships, Patrick Diller, told us that the optimal Village size is 30-50 shelters (about 60-100 beds), based on expenses per shelter.

**E. Tiny Home Village Service Providers:** Villages are operated by what the city calls a service provider. <u>Hope of the Valley Rescue Mission</u> (HVRM) runs six sites, while <u>Salvation Army</u>, <u>Urban Alchemy</u>, and <u>Union Station Homeless Services</u> are each contracted to run one site.

Irvin Parra, Senior Director of Interim Housing at HVRM, has told us that 50 shelters (about 100 beds) seems to be the most cost effective for ongoing operational expenses.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> There are usually three or four Pallet shelters per Village that are built with one bed to be ADA accessible, which is why the number of beds in a Village is not exactly double the number of shelters.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Ethan Ward, "Understanding LA's Homelessness Issues," laist.com, September 24, 2021

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Pallet Shelters, "Uplifting At-Risk Veterans," palletshelter.com, February 21, 2022

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Pallet does not use the term "tiny homes" for its shelters, but the term is used by the city and by media outlets.

#### **IV. Comparative Estimated Costs of Los Angeles Tiny Home Villages**

**A.** Comparative Costs of Los Angeles Tiny Home Villages: Chart I on pg 5 below lists the nine Villages currently in operation.

The number of beds and tiny home shelters (Column B) and the estimated construction costs (Column D) come from documents produced by the Department of Public Works in the Los Angeles Bureau of Engineering and accessed through public records requests. The documents are called ROMs, which stands for Rough Order of Magnitude. The estimated per bed construction cost (Column C) was calculated as the number of beds divided by the estimated construction cost. The estimated annual operating budgets (Column E) were calculated as the number of beds in a Village times \$55 per night times 365 days in a year, a formula shared in an email from Meg Barclay, former Homeless Coordinator in the LA Office of the City Administrative Officer (left this position in August 2021), on July 13, 2021.

**B. Problems with the Number Estimates:** The information we have found in trying to ascertain the total construction costs is imperfect and incomplete. Even though nine Villages have already opened, the actual construction costs for completed projects are not publicly available.

We have found documentation of the actual construction cost in just one case, Alexandria Park (200 beds), because it was listed in an <u>undated joint report</u> from the Bureau of Contract Administration and the Bureau of Engineering that was released on August 8, 2021, in response to our public records request. They stated that 21 change orders were submitted during the Alexandria Park project, decreasing the contract amount by \$464,253 and bringing the total cost down to \$7,361,862.

Further complicating this math is the fact that, while the ROM estimated \$8,456,300 for the project, the actual contract amount approved by the city council was \$7,826,115 with a contingency of \$782,600, giving a total authorized budget of \$8,608,715. In most cases, these details are not publicly available, and so this report uses the ROM cost estimates because that is what we were able to obtain for each Village.

The City also stated that the Echo Park Village came in under the estimated budget, decreasing from \$5,738,000 to about \$3 million. This information was provided in an April 1, 2021, email to reporter Barry Lank, but the City declined to confirm the information in response to our request for the exact number. 18

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> The City approved a construction budget of \$5.7 million for the Echo Park site, but reporting by Barry Lank citing an April 1, 2021, email from Mary Nemick of the Bureau of Engineering said the actual cost would be about \$3 million. In response to our request for details, Mary Nemick replied by email on July 13, 2021, "We are not able to provide that information. Sorry about that. But thanks, Mary."

The reason the Alexandria Park and Echo Park costs matter so much is that in the only two cases in which the actual construction costs are known, those costs decreased significantly from the ROM estimate. This gives rise to the question of whether the per-bed cost estimates in this report are all higher than the actual per-bed costs.

Of the nine opened Villages, Column C shows vast differences in the estimated construction costs per bed: the highest is Echo Park's estimate of \$77,541 per bed, while the lowest is Arroyo Seco, at \$32,712 per bed. If the Echo Park actual cost of \$3,000,000 is used, that Village's per-bed cost would actually be \$40,541.

This leads us to question the accuracy of the high construction cost per bed estimates for Chandler Blvd (\$65,783) and Saticoy + Whitsett (\$60,047). In the case of Saticoy + Whitsett, a September 2, 2021, document listing all of the projects in Council District 2 has a cost estimate of \$5,329,221, but it is not clear whether that includes all construction costs, and the origin of that number is unknown.<sup>19</sup>

Lacking an explanation for why the actual construction costs for Alexandria Park and Echo Park, the average total cost per bed in <a href="Chart I">Chart I</a> below could be substantially overstated. We will continue to request more data from the government in an effort to clarify these potential anomalies.

Source: Barry Lank, "A 'village' of 64-square-foot homeless shelters is taking shape in an Echo Park parking lot," theeastsiderla.com, April 8. 2021

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Bureau of Engineering, "Council District Capital Improvement Programs Report of Projects in Design or Construction," boe.lacity.org, Sep. 2, 2021

Chart I Comparative One-Time Per-Bed Costs of Los Angeles Tiny Home Villages								
A. Information on Villages	B. #Beds / # Homes	C. Estimated Per Bed Construction Cost	D. Estimated Total Construction Cost <sup>20</sup>	E. Estimated Annual Operating Budget <sup>21</sup> Per Bed / Total				
1. Chandler Blvd 11471 Chandler Blvd, North Hollywood, CA 91601 Opened: February 2021 / Service Provider (S.P.): Hope of the Valley Rescue Mission (HVRM)	<b>75</b> /39	\$65,783	\$4,933,700	<b>\$20,075</b> / \$1,505,625				
2. Alexandria Park 6099 Laurel Canyon Road, North Hollywood, CA 91606 Opened: April 2021 / S.P.: HVRM	<b>200</b> /103	\$42,282 [estimated]; \$36,809 [actual] <sup>22</sup>	\$8,456,300 [estimated]; \$7,361,862 [actual] <sup>23</sup>	<b>\$20,075</b> / \$4,015,000				
3. <b>Vanalden</b> (aka Sycamore Cabin Community / Reseda / Vanowen) <sup>24</sup> 6700 Vanalden Ave, Reseda, CA 91335 <i>Opened:</i> May 2021 / <i>S.P.:</i> HVRM	<b>101</b> /52	\$33,544	\$3,387,900	<b>\$20,075</b> / \$2,027,575				
4. Wilmington (aka Harbor Park / Figueroa Place) 1221 Figueroa Place, Wilmington, CA 90744 Opened: June 2021 / S.P.: Salvation Army	<b>150</b> /77	\$34,906	\$5,235,835	<b>\$20,075</b> / \$3,011,250				
5. Echo Park (aka Alvarado) 1455 N Alvarado St., Los Angeles, CA 90026 Opened: June 2021 / S.P.: Urban Alchemy	<b>74</b> /38	\$77,541 [estimated]; \$40,541 [actual]	\$5,738,000 [estimated]; <sup>25</sup> \$3,000,000 [actual]	<b>\$20,075</b> / \$1,485,550				

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Estimated construction costs are taken from the Rough Order of Magnitude (ROM) estimates produced by the Los Angeles Bureau of Engineering, and accessed via public records requests.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> The estimated annual operating budgets are calculated as the number of beds times \$55/night times 365 days in a year. While under normal circumstances, the County would only reimburse \$55 per *filled* bed per night, during COVID, the budgets use the total number of beds even though they cannot all be filled due to distancing efforts.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> The per-bed costs of Alexandria Park using the actual construction costs are shown here because this is the only Village for which the actual final cost is confirmed; see next footnote for more.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> A joint report from the Bureau of Contract Administration and Bureau of Engineering stated that, "This project was awarded for \$7,826,115.00 with a contingency of \$782,600.00, giving a total authorized budget of \$8,608,715.00. Twenty-one (21) change orders were issued decreasing the contract amount by \$464,253.00, bringing the total cost of this project to \$7,361,862.00. The project was completed at 5.93 percent below the awarded amount and 14.48 percent below its authorized budget." The City report is undated and was shared by the City on August 8, 2021, in response to our public records request.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Some Villages are referenced by different names by the City, media, and service providers. This report lists all known names.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> The estimated and actual costs are shown for Echo Park because there is reason to believe the actual cost decreased from the estimate. The City approved a construction budget of \$5.7 million for the Echo Park site, but reporting by Barry Lank citing an April 1, 2021, email from Mary Nemick of the Bureau of Engineering said the actual cost would be about \$3 million. In response to our request for details, Mary Nemick replied by email on July 13, 2021, "We are not able to provide that information. Sorry about that. But thanks, Mary." *Source:* Barry Lank, "A 'village' of 64-square-foot homeless shelters is taking shape in an Echo Park parking lot," theeastsiderla.com, April 8, 2021

Chart I Comparative One-Time Per-Bed Costs of Los Angeles Tiny Home Villages									
A. Information on Villages	B. #Beds/ #Homes	C. Estimated Per Bed Construction Cost	D. Estimated Total Construction Cost <sup>20</sup>	E. Estimated Annual Operating Budget <sup>21</sup> Per Bed / Total					
6. Topham (aka Tarzana Sunflower Cabin Community) 18616 Topham St., Reseda, CA 91335 Opened: July 2021 / S.P.: HVRM	<b>150</b> /76	\$35,548	\$5,332,220	<b>\$20,075</b> / \$3,011,250					
7. Whitsett West (aka Saticoy + Whitsett) 12550 Saticoy St., North Hollywood, CA 91605 Opened: September 2021 / S.P.: HVRM	<b>150</b> /77	\$60,047	\$9,007,000 <sup>26</sup>	<b>\$20,075</b> / \$2,930,950					
8. Arroyo Seco (aka Highland Park) 5982 Arroyo Drive, Los Angeles, CA 90042 Opened: October 2021 / S.P.: HVRM	<b>224</b> /117	\$32,712	\$7,327,376	<b>\$20,075</b> / \$4,496,800					
9. Eagle Rock 7570 N. Figueroa St., Los Angeles, CA 90041 S.P.: Union Station Homeless Services Opened: March 23, 2022	<b>93</b> /48	\$41,206	\$3,832,137	<b>\$20,075</b> / \$1,866,975					
AVERAGE FOR ALL VILLAGES  Columns B and C calculated by adding the totals for each village, found in Chart II, divided by nine villages; Column D calculated with the formula of \$55 per bed per night x 365 nights per year	135 Beds <sup>27</sup> / 70 Homes	\$47,063 per bed [estimated]; <sup>28</sup> \$42,344 per bed [estimated + actual cost when known]	\$5,916,719 <sup>29</sup> per Village [estimated]; \$5,490,892 per Village [estimated + actual cost when known]	\$20,075 per bed / \$2,705,664 per Village					

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> A city document showing all the projects in Council District 2 has a cost estimate of \$5,329,221. This report is using the number in the ROM, \$9,007,000, until there is confirmation that the actual project cost was lower. *Source:* Bureau of Engineering, "Council District Capital Improvement Programs Report of Projects in Design or Construction," boe.lacity.org, Sep. 2, 2021

 $<sup>^{27}</sup>$  Avg beds: (75 + 200 + 101 + 150 + 74 + 150 + 93 + 224 + 150) / 9 = 135

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Avg per-bed cost: (\$65,783 + \$42,281 + \$33,544 + \$34,906 + \$77,541 + \$35,548 + \$41,206 + \$32,712 + \$60,047) / 9 = \$47,246 [estimated]; (\$65,783 + \$36,809 + \$33,544 + \$34,906 + \$40,541 + \$35,548 + \$41,206 + \$32,712 + \$60,047) / 9 = \$42,344 [estimated for six Villages and actual for Alexandria Park and Echo Park]

 $<sup>^{29}</sup>$  Avg total one-time construction cost: (\$4,933,700 + \$8,456,300 + \$3,387,900 + \$5,235,835 + \$5,738,000 + \$5,332,220 + \$3,832,137 + \$7,327,376 + \$9,007,000) / 9 = \$5,916,719 [estimated]; (\$4,933,700 + \$7,361,862 + \$3,387,900 + \$5,235,835 + \$3,000,000 + \$5,332,220 + \$3,832,137 + \$7,327,376 + \$9,007,000) / 9 = \$5,490,892

# V. Line Item Construction and Operating Costs for Tiny Home Villages

A. Specific Costs of Constructing Tiny Home Villages in Los Angeles: Chart II attempts to document all of the line item costs for building tiny home villages in Los Angeles. The listed costs for constructing tiny home villages include everything except land acquisition. The costs include basic infrastructure such as setting up electricity, sanitation, water, and plumbing, unless otherwise noted. Each Pallet shelter takes 20 amp/120 volt service (although this might be higher under certain circumstances).

		Tiny H	lome Villa	Char ges One-T		truction Co	osts		
A.	В.	C.	D.	E.	F.	G.	H.	l.	J.
Budget Line	Chandler	Alexandria	Vanalden	Wilmington	Echo Park	Topham	Eagle	Arroyo	Whitsett
Item	Total	Total	Total	Total	Total	Total	Rock	Seco	West
	_	_	_	_	_	_	Total	Total	Total
	Average	Average	Average	Average	Average	Average	_	_	_
	Cost Per	Cost Per	Cost Per	Cost Per	Cost Per	Cost Per	Average	Average	Average
	Bed	Bed	Bed	Bed	Bed	Bed	Cost Per	Cost Per	Cost Per
	(75 beds /	(200 beds /	(101 beds /	(150 beds /	(74 beds /	(150 beds /	Bed	Bed	Bed
	39 shelters)	103 shelters	52 shelters)	77 shelters)	38 shelters)	76 shelters)	( <b>93 beds</b> / 48 shelters)	( <b>224 beds</b> / 115 shelters)	(150 beds /
							46 Shellers)	115 shellers)	77 shelters)
				Pre-Plan	ning <sup>30</sup>				
1. Design	\$111,000	\$186,000	\$116,000	\$91,000	\$144,000	\$104,000	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$53,000
Bridging	_	_	_	_	_	_			_
Document	\$1,480	\$930	\$1,149	\$607	\$1,946	\$693			\$353
2. California	\$6,000	\$6,000	\$4,000	\$6,000	\$6,000	\$3,000	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$6,000
Environmental	_	_	_	_	_	_			_
Quality Act	\$80	\$30	\$40	\$40	\$81	\$20			\$40
(CEQA) Review	4424.000	4444	4422.000	422.000	472.000	467.000			407.000
3. Support	\$134,000	\$144,000	\$128,000	\$38,000	\$72,000	\$67,000	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$87,000
(consultant, scheduler,	 \$1,787	 \$720	 \$1,267	\$253	 \$973	 \$447			 \$580
geotech,	\$1,767	3720	\$1,207	, <del>,</del> , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	33/3	<b>3447</b>			338U
survey)									
4. Project	\$74,000	\$91,000	\$43,000	\$49,000	\$53,000	\$45,000	Not Listed	Included in	\$70,000
Support (BCA,		_	_		_	_		#5	_
LADOT, BSS,	\$987	\$455	\$426	\$327	\$716	\$300			\$467
ACCT) <sup>31</sup>									

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> All costs listed in this chart come from the rough order of magnitude (ROM) estimates created by the LA Bureau of Engineering, which we obtained via email and public records requests. The ROMs do not all contain the same categories. When categories are similar, any difference in wording is noted in a footnote.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> BCA is Bureau of Contract Administration; LADOT is Los Angeles Department of Transportation; BSS is Bureau of Street Services; ACCT is undefined but appears to be Board of Public Works Office of Accounting

	Chart II Tiny Home Villages One-Time Construction Costs								
A. Budget Line Item	B. Chandler Total	C. Alexandria Total	<b>D. Vanalden</b> Total	E. Wilmington Total	F. Echo Park Total	<b>G. Topham</b> Total	H. Eagle Rock	I. Arroyo Seco	J. Whitsett West
	Average Cost Per Bed (75 beds / 39 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (200 beds / 103 shelters	Average Cost Per Bed (101 beds / 52 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (150 beds / 77 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (74 beds / 38 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (150 beds / 76 shelters)	Total — Average Cost Per Bed (93 beds / 48 shelters)	Total  — Average Cost Per Bed (224 beds / 115 shelters)	Total  Average Cost Per Bed (150 beds /
5. Bureau of Engineering (design support, inspection)	\$204,000 — <b>\$2,720</b>	\$359,000 — <b>\$1,795</b>	\$185,000 — <b>\$1,832</b>	\$227,000 — <b>\$1,153</b>	\$242,000 — <b>\$3,270</b>	\$227,000 — <b>\$1,513</b>	\$256,280 <sup>32</sup> — <b>\$2,756</b>	\$467,780 <sup>33</sup> — <b>\$2,088</b>	\$312,000 — \$2,080
6. Related Cost (all city staff) <sup>34</sup>	\$111,000 — <b>\$1,480</b>	\$180,000 — <b>\$900</b>	\$91,000 — <b>\$901</b>	\$110,000 — <b>\$733</b>	\$178,000 — <b>\$2,405</b>	\$109,000 — <b>\$727</b>	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$211,000 — <b>\$1,407</b>
7. Miscellaneous	\$23,000 — <b>\$307</b>	\$38,000 — <b>\$190</b>	\$12,000 — <b>\$119</b>	\$21,000 — \$140	\$20,000 — <b>\$270</b>	\$11,000 — \$ <b>73</b>	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$42,000 — <b>\$280</b>
8. Mobilization (site prep work, etc.)	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$100,000 — \$667	\$100,000 — \$1,075	\$100,000 — <b>\$446</b>	Not Listed
9. Allowances <sup>35</sup>	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$150,000 <sup>36</sup> — <b>\$1,000</b>	\$70,000 — <b>\$753</b>	\$70,000 — \$313	Not Listed
10. Allowance for Utility fees (Water/ Power)	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$175,000 — <b>\$1,882</b>	Not Listed	Not Listed
Subtotal for Pre-Planning	\$663,000 — <b>\$8,840</b>	\$1,004,000 — <b>\$5,020</b>	\$579,000 — <b>\$5,733</b>	\$542,000 — <b>\$3,613</b>	\$715,000 — <b>\$9,662</b>	\$816,000 — <b>\$5,440</b>	\$601,280 — <b>\$6,465</b>	\$637,780 — <b>\$2,847</b>	\$781,000 — <b>\$5,207</b>
		<del>,</del>		struction In	frastructure	2			
11. Contractor Design	\$194,000 — <b>\$2,587</b>	\$326,000 — <b>\$1,630</b>	\$120,000 — <b>\$1,188</b>	\$182,000 — <b>\$1,213</b>	\$240,000 — <b>\$3,243</b>	\$170,000 — <b>\$1,133</b>	\$123,000 <sup>37</sup> — <b>\$1,323</b>	\$176,000 <sup>38</sup> — <b>\$786</b>	\$520,000 — <b>\$3,467</b>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Listed as "BOE/BCA" - not defined, but interpreted here as staff costs for Bureau of Engineering and Bureau of Contract Administration.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Listed as "BOE/BCA" - not defined, but interpreted here as staff costs for Bureau of Engineering and Bureau of Contract Administration.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> This budget item is from the city's own estimate. It likely does not cover indirect costs incurred by city staff such as the time city council members' offices spend responding to calls from the public and working to get the projects approved and completed. We do not have a way to estimate those costs at this time.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Allowances for Plan Check & Permit Fees, Geotechnical Services (soil and rock mechanics), & Differing Site Condition

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Listed as "Allowances" - unclear for what purpose

<sup>37</sup> Listed as "Designer Fee"

<sup>38</sup> Listed as "Designer Fee"

	Chart II  Tiny Home Villages One-Time Construction Costs								
A. Budget Line Item	B. Chandler Total	C. Alexandria Total	D. Vanalden Total	E. Wilmington Total	F. Echo Park Total	G. Topham Total	H. Eagle Rock	I. Arroyo Seco	J. Whitsett West
	Average Cost Per Bed (75 beds / 39 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (200 beds / 103 shelters	Average Cost Per Bed (101 beds / 52 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (150 beds / 77 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (74 beds / 38 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (150 beds / 76 shelters)	Total  — Average Cost Per Bed (93 beds / 48 shelters)	Total  Average Cost Per Bed (224 beds / 115 shelters)	Total  Average Cost Per Bed (150 beds / 77 shelters)
12. Cargo Containers	\$58,000 — <b>\$773</b>	\$97,000 — <b>\$485</b>	\$51,000 — <b>\$505</b>	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed
13. Foundation	\$66,000 — <b>\$880</b>	\$151,000 — <b>\$755</b>	\$80,000 — <b>\$792</b>	\$96,000 — <b>\$640</b>	\$250,000 — <b>\$3,378</b>	\$228,000 <sup>39</sup> — <b>\$1,520</b>	\$156,000 <sup>40</sup> — <b>\$1,677</b>	\$369,000 <sup>41</sup> — <b>\$1,647</b>	\$430,000 — <b>\$2,867</b>
14. Grading/ Paving	\$539,000 — <b>\$7,187</b>	\$1,410,800 — <b>\$7,054</b>	\$228,000 — <b>\$2,257</b>	\$263,000 — <b>\$1,753</b>	\$750,000 — <b>\$10,135</b>	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$980,000 — <b>\$6,533</b>
15. Pet Area	\$42,000 — <b>\$560</b>	Not Listed	\$30,000 — <b>\$297</b>	\$42,000 — <b>\$280</b>	\$41,000 — <b>\$554</b>	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$41,000 — <b>\$273</b>
16. Landscaping	\$45,000 — <b>\$600</b>	\$180,000 — <b>\$900</b>	\$14,000 — <b>\$139</b>	\$15,000 — <b>\$100</b>	\$27,000 — <b>\$365</b>	\$90,000 <sup>42</sup> — <b>\$600</b>	\$256,280 <sup>43</sup> — <b>\$2,756</b>	\$417,600 <sup>44</sup> — <b>\$1,864</b>	\$180,000 — <b>\$1,200</b>
17. Fencing	\$100,000 — <b>\$1,333</b>	\$150,000 — <b>\$750</b>	\$110,000 — <b>\$1,089</b>	\$160,000 — <b>\$1,067</b>	\$140,000 — <b>\$1,892</b>	\$295,000 <sup>45</sup> — <b>\$1,967</b>	\$144,000 <sup>46</sup> — <b>\$1,548</b>	\$368,600 <sup>47</sup> — <b>\$1,646</b>	\$270,000 — <b>\$1,8400</b>
18. Gates	\$23,000 — <b>\$307</b>	\$23,000 — <b>\$115</b>	\$23,000 — <b>\$228</b>	\$10,000 — <b>\$67</b>	\$23,000 — <b>\$311</b>	Included in #17	Included in #17	Included in #17	\$45,000 — <b>\$300</b>
19. Yard Lighting	\$45,000 — <b>\$600</b>	\$45,000 — <b>\$225</b>	\$25,000 — <b>\$248</b>	\$45,000 — <b>\$300</b>	\$17,000 — <b>\$230</b>	\$205,000 <sup>48</sup> — <b>\$1,367</b>	\$50,000 — <b>\$538</b>	\$133,000 <sup>49</sup> — <b>\$594</b>	\$30,000 — <b>\$200</b>
20. Telecommuni- cation	\$11,000 — <b>\$147</b>	\$27,000 — <b>\$135</b>	\$11,000 — <b>\$109</b>	\$11,000 — <b>\$73</b>	\$13,000 — <b>\$176</b>	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$11,000 — <b>\$73</b>
21. Demolition	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$72,000 — <b>\$973</b>	\$36,000 — <b>\$240</b>	\$10,000 — <b>\$108</b>	\$50,000 — <b>\$223</b>	\$180,000 — <b>\$1,200</b>

<sup>39</sup> Listed as "Level & Anchor Pallet Shelters"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Listed as "Level & Anchor Pallet Shelters"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Listed as "Level & Anchor Pallet Shelters"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Listed as "Miscellaneous Site Improvements"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Listed as "Misc. Site Improvements"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Listed as "Miscellaneous Site Improvements"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Listed as "Fencing & Gates w/Privacy Slats"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Fencing and gates with privacy slats are combined.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Listed as "Fencing & Gates w/Privacy Slats"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Listed as "Site Lighting"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Listed as "Site Lighting"

	Chart II  Tiny Home Villages One-Time Construction Costs								
		liny F	iome villa	ges One-1	ime Consi	truction Co	osts		
A.	В.	C.	D.	E.	F.	G.	H.	I.	J.
<b>Budget Line</b>	Chandler	Alexandria	Vanalden	Wilmington	Echo Park	Topham	Eagle	Arroyo	Whitsett
Item	Total	Total	Total	Total	Total	Total	Rock	Seco	West
	_	_	_	_	_	_	Total	Total	Total
	Average	Average	Average	Average	Average	Average	_	_	_
	Cost Per	Cost Per	Cost Per	Cost Per	Cost Per	Cost Per	Average	Average	Average
	Bed	Bed	Bed	Bed	Bed	Bed	Cost Per	Cost Per	Cost Per
	(75 beds /	(200 beds /	(101 beds /	(150 beds /	(74 beds /	(150 beds /	Bed	Bed	Bed
	39 shelters)	103 shelters	52 shelters)	77 shelters)	38 shelters)	76 shelters)	(93 beds / 48 shelters)	( <b>224 beds</b> / 115 shelters)	(150 beds /
22. Water Line	\$185,200	\$492,000	\$254,000	\$177,000	\$241,000	\$50,000	\$155,00050	\$500.00051	77 shelters) \$370,000
(domestic)	— —	— —	— —	— J177,000 —	- -	<del>-</del>	— —	— —	— <del>-</del>
(1111)	\$2,469	\$2,460	\$2,515	\$1,180	\$3,257	\$333	\$1,667	\$2,232	\$2,467
23. Water Line	\$115,000	\$492,000	\$183,400	\$115,000	\$28,000	Not Listed	Not Listed	Included in	\$405,000
(fire)	_	_	_	_	_			#22	_
	\$1,533	\$2,460	\$1,816	\$767	\$378		1		\$2,700
24. Sewer Line	\$1,080,000	\$78,000	\$74,000	\$1,155,000	\$100,000	\$75,000	\$62,400 <sup>52</sup>	\$88,736 <sup>53</sup>	Not Listed
(street)	 \$14,400	\$390	 \$733	\$7,700	 \$1,351	\$500	 \$671	\$396	
25. Sewer Line	\$63,000	\$900,000	\$225,000	\$144,000	\$113,000	\$256,00054	\$26,877 <sup>55</sup>	Included in	\$315,000
(site)	_	— —	— —	— — —	—	— — —	— <del>-</del>	#22	— — — — — — — — — — — — — — — — — — —
	\$840	\$4,500	\$2,228	\$960	\$1,527	\$1,707	\$289		\$2,100
26. Electrical	\$360,000	\$360,000	\$135,000	\$198,000	\$1,00,000	\$153,000	\$780,00056	\$1,845,000	\$1,032,000
Line				_	_	_		57	
	\$4,800	\$1,800	\$1,337	\$1,320	\$13,514	\$1,020	\$8,387	 \$8,237	\$6,880
27. Switch	\$35,000	\$75,000	\$35,000	\$35,000	\$35,000	\$575,000	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$35,000
Gear (circuit	_	_	_	_	_	_			_
protection devices)	\$467	\$375	\$347	\$233	\$473	\$3,833			\$233
28.	\$75,000	\$85,000	\$75,000	\$75,000	\$75,000	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$75,000
Transformer									
	\$1,000	\$425	\$743	\$500	\$1,014	4	1	1	\$500
29. Electrical	\$25,000	\$75,000	\$25,000	\$25,000	\$75,000	\$56,000 <sup>58</sup>	\$52,000 <sup>59</sup>	\$123,000 <sup>60</sup>	\$75,000
Subpanel	\$333	 \$375	 \$248	\$167	 \$1,014	\$373	 \$559	 \$549	 \$500
30. General	\$498,000	\$837,000	\$261,000	\$475,000	\$527,000	Not Listed	\$464,500	Not Listed	\$1,153,000
Conditions	_	_	_	_	_		_		_
(resources for construction	\$6,640	\$4,185	\$2,584	\$3,167	\$7,122		\$4,995		\$7,687

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Listed as "On-Site Underground Utilities: Sewer & Domestic Water"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Listed as "On-Site Underground Utilities: Sewer, Domestic Water, Fire Hydrants"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Listed as "Sewer- Connection (ESR)" - ESR is not defined but could mean engineering system requirements.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Listed as "Sewer- Connection (ESR)" - ESR is not defined but could mean engineering system requirements.

<sup>54</sup> Listed as "On site underground Utilities: Sewer, water"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Listed as "Sewer- Facility Charges Per Bed" - It's not clear why the ROM lists this item as "per bed," but the ROM project total does not multiply \$26,877 times the number of beds, so our chart uses \$26,877 as the total for this category.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Listed as "Electrical - Main Switchboard to Local Power Panels"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Listed as "Electrical - Main Switchboard to Local Power Panels"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Listed as "Electrical - All other"

<sup>59</sup> Listed as "Electrical - All other"

<sup>60</sup> Listed as "Electrical - All other"

Chart II									
Tiny Home Villages One-Time Construction Costs									
A. Budget Line	B. Chandler	C. Alexandria	D. Vanalden	E. Wilmington	F. Echo Park	G. Topham	H. Eagle	I. Arroyo	J. Whitsett
Item	Total — Average	Total — Average	Total — Average	Total — Average	Total —	Total —	<b>Rock</b> Total	<b>Seco</b> Total	<b>West</b> Total
	Cost Per Bed (75 beds / 39 shelters)	Cost Per Bed (200 beds / 103 shelters	Cost Per Bed (101 beds / 52 shelters)	Cost Per Bed (150 beds / 77 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (74 beds / 38 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (150 beds / 76 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (93 beds / 48 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (224 beds / 115 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (150 beds /
work, e.g. safety measures, trash removal, trailers, etc.) <sup>61</sup>									
31. Estimate/ Construction	\$277,000 —	\$465,000 —	\$172,000 —	\$390,000 —	\$438,000 —	\$730,500 —	Not Listed	\$467,780 —	\$512,000 —
Contingency 32. Laundry	\$3,693 Not listed	<b>\$2,325</b> Not Listed	\$1,703 Not Listed	<b>\$2,600</b> \$142,000	<b>\$5,919</b> \$331,000 <sup>62</sup>	<b>\$4,4870</b> \$405,000	\$102,500	<b>\$2,088</b> \$102,500	\$3,413 \$581,000 <sup>63</sup>
Modular Unit				_ \$947	_ \$4,473	_ \$2,700	_ \$1,102	_ \$458	_ \$3,873
33. Light Relocation	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$4,000 — <b>\$54</b>	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed
34. AC Grind & Overlay	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$10,000 — <b>\$67</b>	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed
35. Guard Booth	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$30,000 — <b>\$200</b>	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed
36. Site Furnishing	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$150,000 — <b>\$1,000</b>	Not Listed	\$76,000 — <b>\$339</b>	Not Listed
37. Mechanical & Plumbing	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$30,000 — <b>\$200</b>	\$52,000 — <b>\$559</b>	\$123,000 — <b>\$549</b>	Not Listed
38. Internet & Security Conduits	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$45,000 — <b>\$300</b>	\$36,400 — <b>\$391</b>	\$86,100 — <b>\$384</b>	Not Listed
39. Smoke & Fire Alarm	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$91,000 — <b>\$607</b>	\$62,400 — <b>\$671</b>	\$138,000 — <b>\$616</b>	Not Listed
40. DWP Water and Power	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$245,000 — <b>\$1,094</b>	Not Listed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> The City documents do not define "General Conditions," but this term is used in construction to refer to costs incurred during the process of completing the work. Those costs can be in the field (site management, safety measures, trailers, trash removal, etc.) as well as administrative (project engineers, project management, bookkeeping, etc.). Source: David M. Watson, "Construction General Condition's vs General Requirement's," linkedin.com, July 7, 2018

<sup>62</sup> Listed as "Modular Building"

<sup>63</sup> Listed as "Modular Building"

		Tiny H	Iome Villa	Char ges One-T		truction Co	osts		
A. Budget Line	B. Chandler	C. Alexandria	D. Vanalden	E. Wilmington	F. Echo Park	G. Topham	H. Eagle	I. Arroyo	J. Whitsett
Item	Total	Total	Total	Total	Total	Total	Rock	Seco	West
	_		_		_	_	Total	Total	Total
	Average Cost Per Bed (75 beds / 39 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (200 beds / 103 shelters	Average Cost Per Bed (101 beds / 52 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (150 beds / 77 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (74 beds / 38 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (150 beds / 76 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (93 beds / 48 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (224 beds / 115 shelters)	Average Cost Per Bed (150 beds /
Subtotal for	\$3,836,200	\$6,268,800	\$2,131,400	\$3,755,000	\$4,540,000	\$3,680,500	\$2,533,357	\$5,309,316	\$7,240,000
Construction	_	_	_	_	_	_	_	_	_
Infrastructure	\$51,149	\$31,344	\$21,103	\$25,033	\$61,351	\$24,537	\$27,240	\$23,702	\$48,267
			Tiny H	lomes and V	illage Add-0	Ons			
40. Pallet Shelters (tiny home shelters plus	\$299,000 [36 shelters <sup>64</sup> ] —	\$846,000 [105 shelters] —	\$450,000 [55 shelters] —	\$633,000 [78 residential shelters	\$323,000 [38 residential shelters	\$637,000 [77 residential shelters	\$468,000 [48 residential shelters	\$1,107,000 — \$4,942	\$644,000 — <b>\$4,293</b>
installation)	\$3,987	\$4,230	\$4,455	(64 ft²)] — \$ <b>4,220</b>	(64 ft²)] — \$ <b>4,365</b>	(64 ft²)] — \$ <b>4,247</b>	(64 ft²), one guard booth] — \$5,032		
41. Picnic Table/	\$23,500 —	\$35,500 —	\$20,500 —	\$62,700 —	\$33,000 —	Not Listed	\$30,000 <sup>65</sup>	Not Listed	\$78,000 —
Umbrellas	\$313	\$178	\$203	\$418	\$446		\$323		\$520
42. Hygiene trailers	\$112,000 —	\$302,000 —	\$207,000 —	\$207,000 —	\$117,000 —	\$175,000 —	\$176,000 —	\$261,000 —	\$216,000 —
(bathrooms and showers)	\$1,493	\$1,510	\$2,050	\$1,380	\$1,581	\$1,167	\$1,892	\$1,165	\$1,440
43. Office Equipment, staff phones, furnishings	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$23,500 <sup>66</sup> — <b>\$253</b>	Not Listed	Not Listed
44. Pet Crates	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$3,135 —	\$3,000 —	\$3,000 —	Not Listed	\$1,080 —	\$5,000 —
4E Lookers /	Not Listad	Not Listad	Not Listad	\$21	\$41 \$7,000	\$20 \$20,720	Not Listad	\$5 \$11,200	\$33
45. Lockers / Storage Bins	Not Listed	Not Listed	Not Listed	\$33,000 — <b>\$220</b>	\$7,000 — <b>\$95</b>	\$20,720 — <b>\$138</b>	Not Listed	\$11,200 — <b>\$50</b>	\$43,000 — <b>\$287</b>
Subtotal for	\$434,500	\$1,183,500	\$677,500	\$938,835	\$483,000	\$835,720	\$697,500	\$1,380,280	\$986,000
Tiny Homes & Other Supplies	_ \$5,793	_ \$5,918	_ \$6,708	_ \$6,259	_ \$6,527	_ \$5,571	_ \$7,500	_ \$6,162	_ \$6,753

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Type and size of Pallet shelters not specified; it is unclear why the ROM lists 36 for a community that has 39 shelters. Emails furnished in response to a public records request showed that the city paid for 39 Pallet shelters.

<sup>65</sup> Listed as "Site Furnishings"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> A January 6, 2021, memo from the Municipal Facilities Committee to the LA City Council signed by City Administrative Officer Richard H. Llewellyn, Jr. said that \$23,500 had been approved for these items. It is not clear whether that amount covers all the costs of this category, nor whether the costs for the other sites account for this category of expenses.

	Chart II  Tiny Home Villages One-Time Construction Costs								
A. Budget Line Item	B. Chandler  Total  —  Average Cost Per Bed (75 beds / 39 shelters)	C. Alexandria Total — Average Cost Per Bed (200 beds / 103 shelters	D. Vanalden  Total  — Average Cost Per Bed (101 beds / 52 shelters)	E. Wilmington Total — Average Cost Per Bed (150 beds / 77 shelters)	F. Echo Park  Total  — Average Cost Per Bed (74 beds / 38 shelters)	G. Topham  Total  — Average Cost Per Bed (150 beds / 76 shelters)	H. Eagle Rock Total — Average Cost Per Bed (93 beds / 48 shelters)	I. Arroyo Seco Total — Average Cost Per Bed (224 beds / 115 shelters)	J. Whitsett West Total — Average Cost Per Bed (150 beds / 77 shelters)
One-Time Construction Costs TOTAL	\$4,933,700 — \$65,783 per bed	\$8,456,300 (\$7,361,862 actual) <sup>67</sup> — \$42,282 per bed (\$36,809 actual) <sup>68</sup>	\$3,387,900 — \$33,544 per bed	\$5,235,835 — \$34,906 per bed	\$5,738,000 (\$3,000,000 actual) — \$77,541 per bed (\$40,541 actual)	\$5,332,220 — \$35,548 per bed	\$3,832,137 — \$41,206 per bed	\$7,327,376 — \$32,712 per bed	\$9,007,000 - \$60,047 per bed

**B.** Operating Costs of Tiny Home Villages in Los Angeles: The LA Office of the City Administrative Officer stated in a July 13, 2021, email that the annual operating budget for all of the Villages is based on a \$55 per bed per night rate, so each Villages' budget is calculated as \$55 x 365 x the number of beds.<sup>69</sup> Utilities and insurance premiums appear to be covered in the service provider budgets.

In addition to the ongoing operating costs for the service providers, a second category of operating costs is City/County operations and oversight. These costs might include City or County management and staff costs for oversight of the operations, technical support, processing reimbursements, and maintaining major building systems such as plumbing and electrical.<sup>70</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> The costs in this chart reflect LA Bureau of Engineering estimates prior to construction because the city has not stated the actual costs for the finished villages, except for Alexandria Park (actual cost \$7,361,862, divided by 200 beds = \$36,809 per bed) and Echo Park (actual cost \$3,00,000, divided by 74 beds = \$40,541 per bed).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> See discussion on page 5 for details.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Meg Barclay, former Homeless Coordinator in the LA Office of the City Administrative Officer (left this position in August 2021), wrote in a July 13, 2021, email, "The operating budget for all of the sites is based on a \$55 bed rate, so to get the annual operating for Eagle Rock, you just need to multiply the number of beds by \$55 times 365. Since Eagle Rock has 93 beds, the annual operating funding is \$1,866,975."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> A February 25, 2021, memo from the General Manager and City Purchasing Agent stated that the City is responsible for maintaining "major building systems including plumbing, electrical, roof, mechanical systems, and all doors, door frames, and door openers." We have not found any cost estimates for the City's expenses for these items. The service provider agreed to "directly set up utility services with utility providers as well as provide routine daily maintenance," which should be covered in the service provider budget. *Source:* Tony M. Royster, "Request Authority to Negotiate and Execute a License Agreement With Hope of the Valley Rescue Mission to Operate Interim Housing at 19020-19040 West Vanowen Street," clkrep.lacity.org, February 25, 2021

As of the date of this report, requests for information on the City/County operating costs have not been answered.

Chart III below shows the service provider operating budget for Chandler Blvd, the first village to open in February 2021. The service provider, HVRM, provided budget information covering 2/1/21-6/30/21 (the Village's opening month through the end of the fiscal year).

To determine the annualized operating budget, each entry was divided by the number of months listed in the provided budget (since it covered less than a full year), then multiplied by 12.

The purpose of this chart is to show the items that are including in the operating budgets that are created by the Los Angeles Homeless Services Authority ("LAHSA"), an agency with joint powers authority of the City and County of Los Angeles. Service providers use a budget template provided by LAHSA to fill in the details, then submit it for review and reimbursement.

Other service providers have not responded to requests for information on their budgets, and the City and County have not responded to requests for information about the additional costs incurred by government agencies for oversight and staffing.

The operating costs are likely underestimated given the omission of City and County costs to keep the Villages running.

CHART III Sample Annual Operating Budget for Tiny Home Villages in Los Angeles							
A. Rudget Line Item	B. Chandler Blvd						
Budget Line Item							
	Annualized Operating Costs						
	_						
	Annual Operating Cost Per Bed						
	(75)						
1. Program Manager <sup>71</sup>	\$73,091						
	_						
	\$975						
2. Case Manager/Housing Navigators (full-time)	\$152,251						
	_						
	\$2,030						
3. Case Manager/Housing Navigators (part-time)	\$20,801						
	_						
	\$277						
4. Client Service Monitor (full-time)	\$137,030						
	_						

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> All salary costs include salary plus benefits and payroll taxes.

CHART III Sample Annual Operating Budget for Tiny Home Villages in Los Angeles						
A. Budget Line Item	B. Chandler Blvd Annualized Operating Costs					
	— Annual Operating Cost Per Bed (75)					
	\$1,827					
5. Client Service Monitor (part-time)	\$44,928 —					
	\$599					
6. Hygiene Monitor	\$91,354 —					
	\$1,218					
7. Janitor	\$45,677 —					
	\$609					
8. Client Service Monitor FT 4 months	\$137,034 —					
	\$1,827					
9. Driver	\$57,096 —					
	\$761					
10. Director of Tiny Homes Villages	\$13,728					
	 \$183					
11. Sr. Director of Interim Housing	\$9,760					
	 \$130					
12. Security (security cameras and outsourced security officers)	\$288,000					
officersy	<del>-</del>					
13 Transportation	<b>\$3,840</b> \$12,000					
13. Transportation	\$12,000 —					
	\$160					
14. Food	\$131,040					
	. , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,					
	\$1,747					
15. Supplies, Hardware, Software	\$108,960 —					
	\$1,453					
16. Utilities/Insurance	\$49,200 —					

CHART III Sample Annual Operating Budget for Tiny Home Villages in Los Angeles	
Α.	В.
Budget Line Item	Chandler Blvd
	Annualized Operating Costs
	_
	Annual Operating Cost Per Bed
	(75)
	\$656
17. Internet	\$6,000
	_
	\$80
18. Office Trailer	\$4,800
	_
	\$64
19. Maintenance/Repair/Custodian	\$14,186
	_
	\$189
20. Furniture, Fixtures, Equipment	\$23,500
	_
	\$313
21. Indirect Cost Amount	\$135,000
	_
	\$1,800
Operating Costs TOTAL	\$1,555,436 annually
	_
	\$20,738 per night
	(\$20,738 total/365 days = \$56.80 per bed per night)

Although service providers are currently reimbursed at a rate of \$55 per bed per night, the above calculations show an average per-bed cost of \$56.80 per night. We do not have an explanation for the \$1.80 difference, but it could be accounted for in a variety of ways.

HVRM and other service providers may provide other services to residents of Villages that are not covered in the above budget, such as child care assistance, legal services/document fees, life skills training, outpatient/behavioral health, housing search and placement, credit repair, and financial assistance for permanent housing (rental applications, security deposit, moving fees, etc.). They leverage other funding sources and community resources to meet these needs.

In addition to the \$55 per bed charge, service providers such as HVRM conduct fundraising activities and receive donations for the Villages and their residents. One example is a \$85,000 donation from

actor Jon Cryer and his wife Lisa Joyner to HVRM for the Alexandria Park tiny home village.<sup>72</sup> It's unclear if HVRM and other service providers are therefore making the \$55/night County reimbursement plus other donations to help offset the costs.

#### VI. Conclusion

Tiny Home Villages have been built in Los Angeles to create temporary housing for people experiencing homelessness.

Some of the biggest construction costs appear to involve grading/paving the sites and installing sewer and power lines. The Pallet shelters themselves, at an average of \$4,419 per bed, account for a small portion of the \$42,344 average construction cost per bed.

The ongoing operational costs are calculated at an average of \$20,075 per bed annually, but that does not include costs incurred by the City or County for management and oversight of the service providers. LAHSA has not answered our requests for information on their costs related to the Villages.

By way of rough comparison, the average construction cost of housing units for people experiencing homelessness in LA was \$596,846 in 2021. A fenced-in campground for tents with support services for its residents cost \$31,959 per tent annually.

As mentioned at the beginning of this report, the concept, development, and operations of tiny home villages are quickly evolving. The above costs will probably fluctuate over time.

 $<sup>^{72}</sup>$  Mike Terry, "Hope of the Valley Takes Strides Toward a Fundraising Goal," sanfernandosun.com, March 31, 2021

#### **APPENDIX A: Photos of LA's First Tiny Home Village**

The Chandler Blvd site opened in February 2021



An overhead view of the Chandler Blvd tiny home village



Inside an 8x8 foot Pallet shelter



Communal area inside the village



Inside view

